

- [Query](#)
- [Reports](#)
- [Utilities](#)
- [Logout](#)

ADRMOP, CLOSED, E-Filing, REFR&R-BZ

**U.S. District Court  
California Northern District (San Francisco)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 3:07-cv-04997-MHP**

Center for Biological Diversity v. Office of Management and Budget

Assigned to: Hon. Marilyn H. Patel

Referred to: Magistrate Judge Bernard Zimmerman

Cause: 05:552 Right to Privacy Act

Date Filed: 09/27/2007

Date Terminated: 02/09/2010

Jury Demand: None

Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of Information Act

Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**Center for Biological Diversity**  
*a non-profit organization*

represented by **Deborah Ann Sivas**

Environmental Law Clinic  
Mills Legal Clinic at Stanford Law School  
Crown Quadrangle  
559 Nathan Abbott Way  
Stanford, CA 94305-8610  
650-725-8571  
Fax: 650-723-4426  
Email: dsivas@stanford.edu  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Justin Augustine**

Center for Biological Diversity  
351 California St.  
Suite 600  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
415-436-9682 ext. 302  
Fax: 415-436-9683  
Email:

JAUGUSTINE@BIOLOGICALDIVERSITY.ORG  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Leah Jane Russin**

Environmental Law Clinic  
Mills Legal Clinic at Stanford Law School  
Crown Quadrangle  
559 Nathan Abbott Way  
Stanford, CA 94305  
650-725-8571  
Fax: 650-723-4426  
Email: leahrussin@law.stanford.edu  
*TERMINATED: 12/19/2008*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Vera Prinz Pardee**  
Center for Biological Diversity  
351 California, Ste 600  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
415-436-9682  
Email: vpardee@biologicaldiversity.org  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant**

**Office of Management and Budget**

represented by **Michael Thomas Pyle**  
United States Attorney's Office  
150 Almaden Blvd  
Suite 900  
San Francisco, CA 95113  
408-535-5087  
Fax: 408-535-5081  
Email: michael.t.pyle@usdoj.gov  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
09/27/2007	<u><a href="#">1</a></u>	COMPLAINT for Declaratory Judgment and Injunctive Relief against Office of Management and Budget (Filing fee \$ 350.00, receipt number 34611010860). Filed by Center for Biological Diversity. (gba, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/27/2007) Additional attachment(s) added on 10/5/2007 (gba, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 09/28/2007)

09/27/2007	<a href="#">2</a>	ADR SCHEDULING ORDER: Case Management Statement due by 12/31/2007. Case Management Conference set for 1/7/2008 04:00 PM. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> MHP Standing Order# <a href="#">2</a> New Standing Order)(gba, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/27/2007) (Entered: 09/28/2007)
09/27/2007	<a href="#">3</a>	Certificate of Interested Entities or Persons by Center for Biological Diversity (gba, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/27/2007) Additional attachment(s) added on 10/5/2007 (gba, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 09/28/2007)
09/27/2007		Summons Issued as to Office of Management and Budget. (gba, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/27/2007) (Entered: 09/28/2007)
09/27/2007		CASE DESIGNATED for Electronic Filing. (gba, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/27/2007) (Entered: 09/28/2007)
10/24/2007	<a href="#">4</a>	SUMMONS Returned Executed by Center for Biological Diversity. Office of Management and Budget served on 10/1/2007, answer due 11/30/2007. (FOIA Case: Answer due in 30 Days--10/31/2007) (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Certificate of Service) (Augustine, Justin) (Filed on 10/24/2007) (Entered: 10/24/2007)
11/02/2007	<a href="#">5</a>	ANSWER to Complaint byOffice of Management and Budget. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit 1# <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit 2# <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit 3)(Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 11/2/2007) (Entered: 11/02/2007)
12/10/2007	<a href="#">6</a>	Memorandum in Opposition to OMB's Administrative Motion to Consider Whether Cases Should Be Related filed byCenter for Biological Diversity. (Sivas, Deborah) (Filed on 12/10/2007) (Entered: 12/10/2007)
12/10/2007	<a href="#">7</a>	Proposed Order re <a href="#">6</a> Memorandum in Opposition to OMB's Administrative Motion to Consider Whether Cases Should Be Related by Center for Biological Diversity. (Sivas, Deborah) (Filed on 12/10/2007) (Entered: 12/10/2007)
12/17/2007	<a href="#">8</a>	CLERK'S NOTICE - The Court has reviewed the motion and determined that no cases are related and no reassignments shall occur. (jjo, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 12/17/2007) (Entered: 12/17/2007)
12/19/2007	<a href="#">9</a>	ADR Clerks Notice re: Non-Compliance with Court Order. (tjs, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 12/19/2007) (Entered: 12/19/2007)
12/20/2007	<a href="#">10</a>	ADR Certification (ADR L.R. 3-5b) of discussion of ADR options (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 12/20/2007) (Entered: 12/20/2007)
12/20/2007	<a href="#">11</a>	ADR Certification (ADR L.R. 3-5b) of discussion of ADR options (Russin, Leah) (Filed on 12/20/2007) (Entered: 12/20/2007)

12/20/2007	<a href="#">12</a>	NOTICE of need for ADR Phone Conference (ADR L.R. 3-5 d) (Russin, Leah) (Filed on 12/20/2007) (Entered: 12/20/2007)
12/21/2007	13	<b>**PLEASE SEE DOCUMENT #14**</b> ADR Clerks Notice Setting ADR Phone Conference on 1/3/08 at 11:30 a.m. Please take note that plaintiff's counsel initiates the call to all parties. (tjs, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 12/21/2007) Modified on 12/21/2007 (tjs, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 12/21/2007)
12/21/2007	<a href="#">14</a>	<b>*CORRECTED*</b> ADR Clerks Notice Setting ADR Phone Conference on 1/3/08 at 11:30 a.m. Please take note that plaintiff's counsel initiates the call to all parties. (tjs, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 12/21/2007) (Entered: 12/21/2007)
12/21/2007		ADR Remark: The ADR Phone Conference has been rescheduled to 1/4/08 at 11:30 a.m. (tjs, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 12/21/2007) (Entered: 12/21/2007)
12/31/2007	<a href="#">15</a>	JOINT CASE MANAGEMENT STATEMENT <i>Joint Case Management Conference Statement</i> filed by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 12/31/2007) (Entered: 12/31/2007)
01/09/2008	<a href="#">16</a>	<b>***FILED IN ERROR***</b> Minute Entry: Initial Case Management Conference held on 1/7/2008 before Hon. Marilyn Hall Patel (Date Filed: 1/9/2008). Further Status Conference set for 5/5/2008 03:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco; Order re ADR Mediation stayed.(Court Reporter Katherine Powell.) (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Date Filed: 1/9/2008) Modified on 1/9/2008 (awb, COURT-STAFF). (Entered: 01/09/2008)
01/09/2008	<a href="#">17</a>	Minute Entry: Initial Case Management Conference held on 1/7/2008 before Hon. Marilyn Hall Patel (Date Filed: 1/9/2008)Briefing schedules as follows: Cross Motions to be filed 1/25/2008; Oppositions to be filed by 2/8/2008; No Replies; Motions to be heard 2:00 pm on 2/25/2008. (Court Reporter Katherine Powell.) (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Date Filed: 1/9/2008) (Entered: 01/09/2008)
01/25/2008	<a href="#">18</a>	MOTION for Summary Ajudication of Fee Waiver Issue filed by Office of Management and Budget. Motion Hearing set for 2/25/2008 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 1/25/2008) Modified on 1/29/2008 (gba, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 01/25/2008)
01/25/2008	<a href="#">19</a>	Declaration of John F. Morrall, III in Support of <a href="#">18</a> MOTION for Summary <i>Ajudication of Fee Waiver Issue</i> filed by Office of Management and Budget. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit 1, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit 2, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit 3, # <a href="#">4</a> Exhibit 4, # <a href="#">5</a> Exhibit 5, # <a href="#">6</a> Exhibit 6, # <a href="#">7</a> Exhibit 7)(Related document(s) <a href="#">18</a> ) (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 1/25/2008) Modified on 1/29/2008 (gba, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 01/25/2008)

01/25/2008	<a href="#"><u>20</u></a>	Proposed Order re <a href="#"><u>18</u></a> MOTION for Summary <i>Ajudication of Fee Waiver Issue</i> by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 1/25/2008) Modified on 1/29/2008 (gba, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 01/25/2008)
01/25/2008	<a href="#"><u>21</u></a>	MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>on Fee Waiver Issue</i> filed by Center for Biological Diversity. Motion Hearing set for 2/25/2008 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. (Sivas, Deborah) (Filed on 1/25/2008) (Entered: 01/25/2008)
01/25/2008	<a href="#"><u>22</u></a>	Declaration of Kassia Siegel in Support of <a href="#"><u>21</u></a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>on Fee Waiver Issue</i> filed byCenter for Biological Diversity. (Related document(s) <a href="#"><u>21</u></a> ) (Sivas, Deborah) (Filed on 1/25/2008) (Entered: 01/25/2008)
01/25/2008	<a href="#"><u>23</u></a>	Declaration of Justin Augustine in Support of <a href="#"><u>21</u></a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>on Fee Waiver Issue</i> filed byCenter for Biological Diversity. (Related document(s) <a href="#"><u>21</u></a> ) (Sivas, Deborah) (Filed on 1/25/2008) (Entered: 01/25/2008)
01/25/2008	<a href="#"><u>24</u></a>	Proposed Order re <a href="#"><u>21</u></a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>on Fee Waiver Issue Granting Plaintiff's Motion and Denying Defendant's Cross-Motion</i> by Center for Biological Diversity. (Sivas, Deborah) (Filed on 1/25/2008) (Entered: 01/25/2008)
02/08/2008	<a href="#"><u>25</u></a>	Memorandum in Opposition re <a href="#"><u>21</u></a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>on Fee Waiver Issue to Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Ajudication of Fee Waiver Issue</i> filed byOffice of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 2/8/2008) (Entered: 02/08/2008)
02/08/2008	<a href="#"><u>26</u></a>	Memorandum in Opposition re <a href="#"><u>18</u></a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Ajudication of Fee Waiver Issue</i> filed byCenter for Biological Diversity. (Sivas, Deborah) (Filed on 2/8/2008) (Entered: 02/08/2008)
02/13/2008	<a href="#"><u>27</u></a>	CLERK'S NOTICE: Motions Hearing reset for 3/10/2008 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Filed on 2/13/2008) (Entered: 02/13/2008)
03/10/2008	<a href="#"><u>28</u></a>	CLERK'S NOTICE submitting defendant's motion for summary adjudication on the papers; Hearing date of 3/10/2008 vacated (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Filed on 3/10/2008) (Entered: 03/10/2008)
03/13/2008	<a href="#"><u>29</u></a>	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel denying <a href="#"><u>18</u></a> defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment; granting <a href="#"><u>21</u></a> plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Filed on 3/13/2008) (Entered: 03/13/2008)

03/13/2008	<a href="#"><u>30</u></a>	CLERK'S NOTICE: Further Case Management Conference set for 4/21/2008 03:00 PM. Joint Case Management Statement due by 4/11/2008. (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Filed on 3/13/2008) (Entered: 03/13/2008)
04/11/2008	<a href="#"><u>31</u></a>	JOINT CASE MANAGEMENT STATEMENT <i>Joint Subsequent Case Management Conference Statement</i> filed by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 4/11/2008) (Entered: 04/11/2008)
04/22/2008	<a href="#"><u>32</u></a>	Minute Entry: Initial Case Management Conference held on 4/21/2008 before Hon. Marilyn Hall Patel (Date Filed: 4/22/2008); Further Status Conference set for 8/4/2008 03:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. (Court Reporter Juanita Gonzales.) (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Date Filed: 4/22/2008) (Entered: 04/22/2008)
06/04/2008	<a href="#"><u>33</u></a>	NOTICE of Change of Address by Justin Augustine (Augustine, Justin) (Filed on 6/4/2008) (Entered: 06/04/2008)
07/11/2008	<a href="#"><u>34</u></a>	STIPULATION AND <i>[PROPOSED] ORDER TO CONTINUE THE DATE BY WHICH OMB SHALL PRODUCE RESPONSIVE DOCUMENTS AND VAUGHN INDICES TO PLAINTIFF</i> by Center for Biological Diversity, Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 7/11/2008) (Entered: 07/11/2008)
07/15/2008	<a href="#"><u>35</u></a>	STIPULATION AND ORDER continuing dates by which OMB shall complete production of documents and a Vaughn index in response to the FOIA request at issue in this case; Signed by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel on 7/14/2008. (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Filed on 7/15/2008) (Entered: 07/15/2008)
07/28/2008	<a href="#"><u>36</u></a>	CASE MANAGEMENT STATEMENT <i>Joint Subsequent Case Management Conference Statement</i> filed by Center for Biological Diversity, Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 7/28/2008) (Entered: 07/28/2008)
08/05/2008	<a href="#"><u>37</u></a>	Minute Entry: Status Conference held on 8/4/2008 before the Hon. Marilyn Hall Patel (Date Filed: 8/5/2008); Further Status Conference set for 9/15/2008 03:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. (Court Reporter Sahar McVickar.) (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Date Filed: 8/5/2008) (Entered: 08/05/2008)
08/06/2008	<a href="#"><u>38</u></a>	STIPULATION <i>and [Proposed] Order Regarding Schedule for Remainder of the Case</i> by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 8/6/2008) (Entered: 08/06/2008)

08/07/2008	<a href="#">39</a>	ORDER granting <a href="#">38</a> Stipulation Regarding Schedule For Remainder of Case filed by Office of Management and Budget. Case Management Conference set for 9/8/2008 03:00 PM. Cross Motions Hearing set for 11/17/2008 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco.. Signed by Judge Marilyn H. Patel on 8/7/2008. (mat, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 8/7/2008) (Entered: 08/08/2008)
09/02/2008	<a href="#">40</a>	JOINT CASE MANAGEMENT STATEMENT filed by Center for Biological Diversity. (Augustine, Justin) (Filed on 9/2/2008) (Entered: 09/02/2008)
09/08/2008	<a href="#">41</a>	Minute Entry: Status Conference held on 9/8/2008 before the Hon. Marilyn Hall Patel (Date Filed: 9/8/2008). (Court Reporter Kathy Wyatt.) (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Date Filed: 9/8/2008) (Entered: 09/09/2008)
10/06/2008	<a href="#">42</a>	MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support; Proposed Order</i> , filed by Center for Biological Diversity. Motion Hearing set for 11/10/2008 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Proposed Order)(Augustine, Justin) (Filed on 10/6/2008) (Entered: 10/06/2008)
10/06/2008	<a href="#">43</a>	Declaration of Justin Augustine in Support of <a href="#">42</a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support; Proposed Order</i> , filed by Center for Biological Diversity. (Related document(s) <a href="#">42</a> ) (Augustine, Justin) (Filed on 10/6/2008) (Entered: 10/06/2008)
10/06/2008	<a href="#">44</a>	MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>DEFENDANT OFFICE OF MANAGEMENT AND BUDGET'S NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR SUMMARY ADJUDICATION</i> filed by Office of Management and Budget. Motion Hearing set for 11/17/2008 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 10/6/2008) (Entered: 10/06/2008)
10/06/2008	<a href="#">45</a>	Declaration of RICHARD P. THEROUX in Support of <a href="#">44</a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>DEFENDANT OFFICE OF MANAGEMENT AND BUDGET'S NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR SUMMARY ADJUDICATION</i> filed by Office of Management and Budget. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit Exhibit 1 part 1 of 5, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit Exhibit 1 part 2 of 5, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit Exhibit 1 part 3 of 5, # <a href="#">4</a> Exhibit Exhibit 1 part 4 of 5, # <a href="#">5</a> Exhibit Exhibit 1 part 5 of 5)(Related document(s) <a href="#">44</a> ) (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 10/6/2008) (Entered: 10/06/2008)
10/06/2008	<a href="#">46</a>	Declaration of KEVIN F. NEYLAND in Support of <a href="#">44</a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>DEFENDANT OFFICE OF MANAGEMENT AND BUDGET'S NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR SUMMARY ADJUDICATION</i> filed by Office of Management and Budget. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit 1, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit 2, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit 3, # <a href="#">4</a> Exhibit 4, # <a href="#">5</a> Exhibit 5, # <a href="#">6</a> Exhibit 6, # <a href="#">7</a> Exhibit 7, # <a href="#">8</a> Exhibit 8)(Related document(s) <a href="#">44</a> ) (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 10/6/2008) (Entered: 10/06/2008)



10/16/2008	<a href="#">47</a>	STIPULATION AND <i>[PROPOSED]</i> ORDER REGARDING DEADLINE FOR FILING OPPOSITION BRIEFS ON PENDING MOTIONS FOR SUMMARY ADJUDICATION by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 10/16/2008) (Entered: 10/16/2008)
10/22/2008	<a href="#">48</a>	STIPULATION AND ORDER AMENDING BRIEFING SCHEDULES re <a href="#">44</a> <a href="#">42</a> Motions for Summary Judgment; Signed by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel on 10/21/2008. (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Filed on 10/22/2008) (Entered: 10/22/2008)
10/23/2008	<a href="#">49</a>	Memorandum in Opposition to <a href="#">44</a> OMB's Motion for Summary Adjudication filed by Center for Biological Diversity. (Augustine, Justin) (Filed on 10/23/2008) Modified on 10/24/2008 (gba, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 10/23/2008)
10/23/2008	<a href="#">50</a>	Memorandum in Opposition to <a href="#">42</a> Plaintiff's Motion for Partial Summary Judgment filed by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 10/23/2008) Modified on 10/24/2008 (gba, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 10/23/2008)
10/23/2008	<a href="#">51</a>	Declaration of Kevin F. Neyland in Support of <a href="#">50</a> Memorandum in Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Partial Summary Judgment filed by Office of Management and Budget. (Related document(s) <a href="#">50</a> ) (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 10/23/2008) (Entered: 10/23/2008)
10/23/2008	<a href="#">52</a>	Declaration of Michael T. Pyle in Support of <a href="#">50</a> Memorandum in Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Partial Summary Judgment filed by Office of Management and Budget. (Related document(s) <a href="#">50</a> ) (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 10/23/2008) (Entered: 10/23/2008)
10/23/2008	<a href="#">53</a>	Proposed Order re <a href="#">50</a> Memorandum in Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Partial Summary Judgment by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 10/23/2008) (Entered: 10/23/2008)
10/23/2008	<a href="#">54</a>	STIPULATION re <a href="#">50</a> Memorandum in Opposition and <i>[Proposed]</i> Order Regarding Filing of Joint Statement of Undisputed Facts by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 10/23/2008) (Entered: 10/23/2008)
11/03/2008	<a href="#">55</a>	STIPULATION and <i>[Proposed]</i> Order Regarding November 3, 2008 Deadline by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 11/3/2008) (Entered: 11/03/2008)
11/18/2008	<a href="#">56</a>	STIPULATION AND ORDER extending 11/3/2008 deadline to 11/13/2008 for OMB to produce final Vaughn index and supporting declarations; Signed by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel on 11/14/2008. (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Filed on 11/18/2008) (Entered: 11/18/2008)



11/19/2008	<a href="#">57</a>	Minute Entry: Motion Hearing held on 11/17/2008 before Hon. Marilyn Hall Patel (Date Filed: 11/19/2008) re <a href="#">44</a> <a href="#">42</a> MOTIONS for Summary Judgment (Court Reporter Sahar McVickar.) (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Date Filed: 11/19/2008) (Entered: 11/19/2008)
11/25/2008	<a href="#">58</a>	***DOCKETED IN ERROR - SEE DOC. 59 *** MEMORANDUM AND ORDER by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel: By stipulation of the parties, defendant is GRANTED partial summary judgment as to the documents withheld under the attorney-client privilege; However, the court must partially DENY defendants motion for summary judgment as to the documents withheld under the other two privileges. The Vaughn index and declarations submitted by defendant are deficient in many respects. The index and declarations identified each document withheld or redacted and the statutory exemption claimed, but failed to provide sufficiently particularized explanations of how disclosure of the particular document would damage the interest protected by the claimed exemption. The court hereby orders defendant to produce a more particularized Vaughn index as to the remaining privileges consistent with this opinion, to provide the court with an adequate factual basis upon which it could conduct a de novo review of the defendants withholding decisions. The court does not conclude that the documents are not exempt as a matter of law, only that the agency has failed to supply the court with the minimal information necessary to make such a determination. Therefore, plaintiffs motion for summary judgment is also DENIED. This order explains why defendants index and declarations are insufficient. Given the number of extensions already granted to defendant to produce documents responsive to CBDs FOIA request, the OMB is ordered to give the production of revised materials sufficient priority to ensure that they are submitted by January 5, 2009. Further, the OMB is on notice that a failure to submit adequate revisions that provide the court with sufficiently particularized explanations of how disclosure will damage the interest protected by the claimed privilege will be deemed a waiver of that privilege. (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Filed on 11/25/2008) Modified on 12/4/2008 (awb, COURT-STAFF). (Entered: 11/25/2008)
12/04/2008	<a href="#">59</a>	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER RE CROSS-MOTIONS FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT; Signed by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel on 11/25/2008. (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Filed on 12/4/2008) (Entered: 12/04/2008)
12/16/2008	<a href="#">60</a>	MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Defendant Office of Management and Budget's Notice of Motion and Motion for Summary Ajudication</i> filed by Office of Management and Budget. Motion Hearing set for 2/2/2009 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 12/16/2008) (Entered: 12/16/2008)
12/16/2008	<a href="#">61</a>	Declaration of Kevin F. Neyland in Support of <a href="#">60</a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Defendant Office of Management and Budget's Notice of Motion and Motion for Summary Ajudication</i> filed by Office of Management and Budget. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit 1, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit 2, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit 3, # <a href="#">4</a> Exhibit 4, # <a href="#">5</a> Exhibit 5, # <a href="#">6</a> Exhibit 6, # <a href="#">7</a> Exhibit 7, # <a href="#">8</a> Exhibit 8)(Related document(s) <a href="#">60</a> ) (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 12/16/2008) (Entered: 12/16/2008)

12/16/2008	<a href="#">62</a>	Declaration of Richard P. Theroux in Support of <a href="#">60</a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Defendant Office of Management and Budget's Notice of Motion and Motion for Summary Ajudication</i> filed byOffice of Management and Budget. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit 1 Part 1 of 3, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit 1 Part 2 of 3, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit 1 Part 3 of 3, # <a href="#">4</a> Exhibit 2)(Related document(s) <a href="#">60</a> ) (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 12/16/2008) (Entered: 12/16/2008)
12/16/2008	<a href="#">63</a>	Proposed Order re <a href="#">60</a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Defendant Office of Management and Budget's Notice of Motion and Motion for Summary Ajudication</i> by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 12/16/2008) (Entered: 12/16/2008)
12/16/2008	<a href="#">64</a>	Second MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Center for Biological Diversity. Motion Hearing set for 2/2/2009 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Declaration of Vera Pardee, # <a href="#">2</a> Proposed Order) (Augustine, Justin) (Filed on 12/16/2008) (Entered: 12/16/2008)
12/18/2008	<a href="#">65</a>	NOTICE by Center for Biological Diversity <i>WITHDRAWAL OF LEAH RUSSIN AS COUNSEL</i> (Russin, Leah) (Filed on 12/18/2008) (Entered: 12/18/2008)
12/19/2008	<a href="#">66</a>	STIPULATION and [Proposed] Order Regarding Briefing Schedule for 1/5/09 Vaughn Index and Declarations by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 12/19/2008) (Entered: 12/19/2008)
12/22/2008	<a href="#">67</a>	STIPULATION AND ORDER AMENDING BRIEFING SCHEDULES for 1/5/09 Vaughn Index and declarations; Motion Hearing set for 2/23/2009 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco; Signed by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel on 12/22/2008. (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Filed on 12/22/2008) (Entered: 12/22/2008)
12/30/2008	<a href="#">68</a>	Memorandum in Opposition re <a href="#">60</a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Defendant Office of Management and Budget's Notice of Motion and Motion for Summary Ajudication</i> filed byOffice of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 12/30/2008) (Entered: 12/30/2008)
12/30/2008	<a href="#">69</a>	Declaration of Michael T. Pyle in Support of <a href="#">68</a> Memorandum in Opposition filed byOffice of Management and Budget. (Related document(s) <a href="#">68</a> ) (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 12/30/2008) (Entered: 12/30/2008)
12/30/2008	<a href="#">70</a>	NOTICE of Appearance by Vera Prinz Pardee (Pardee, Vera) (Filed on 12/30/2008) (Entered: 12/30/2008)
12/30/2008	<a href="#">71</a>	Memorandum in Opposition to Motion for Summary Judgment By Defendant Office of Management and Budget Re "Exchange" Documents filed byCenter for Biological Diversity. (Pardee, Vera) (Filed on 12/30/2008) (Entered: 12/30/2008)

01/06/2009	<a href="#">72</a>	NOTICE by Office of Management and Budget re <a href="#">59</a> Memorandum & Opinion <i>Defendant Office of Mangement and Budget's Notice of Compliance with Court Order</i> (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 1/6/2009) (Entered: 01/06/2009)
01/13/2009	<a href="#">73</a>	STIPULATION <i>and Proposed Order Regarding Briefing Schedule for 1/05/09 Vaughn Index and Declarations</i> by Center for Biological Diversity. (Pardee, Vera) (Filed on 1/13/2009) (Entered: 01/13/2009)
01/14/2009	<a href="#">74</a>	STIPULATION AND ORDER re briefing schedule for Vaughn index: opening briefs to be filed by 2/9/2009; Oppositions to be filed by 2/23/2009; Motion Hearing set for 3/9/2009 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco; Signed by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel on 1/14/2009. (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Filed on 1/14/2009) (Entered: 01/14/2009)
02/02/2009	<a href="#">75</a>	Minute Entry: Motion Hearing held on 2/2/2009 before Hon. Marilyn Hall Patel (Date Filed: 2/2/2009) re <a href="#">60</a> <a href="#">64</a> MOTIONS for Summary Judgment filed by Center for Biological Diversity; Hearing on all pending motions reset for 3/23/2009 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. (Court Reporter Kelly Bryce.) (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Date Filed: 2/2/2009) (Entered: 02/03/2009)
02/04/2009	<a href="#">76</a>	STIPULATION <i>and [Proposed] Order Regarding Briefing Schedule for Remainder of Case</i> by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 2/4/2009) (Entered: 02/04/2009)
02/06/2009	<a href="#">77</a>	STIPULATION AND ORDER re briefing schedule for remainder of case; Signed by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel on 2/6/2009. (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Filed on 2/6/2009) (Entered: 02/06/2009)
02/27/2009	<a href="#">78</a>	MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Defendant Office of Management and Budget's Notice of Motion and Motion for Summary Judgment</i> filed by Office of Management and Budget. Motion Hearing set for 3/23/2009 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 2/27/2009) (Entered: 02/27/2009)
02/27/2009	<a href="#">79</a>	Declaration of Richard P. Theroux, Ph.D. in Support of <a href="#">78</a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Defendant Office of Management and Budget's Notice of Motion and Motion for Summary Judgment Ajudication</i> filed byOffice of Management and Budget. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit 1, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit 2, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit 3)(Related document(s) <a href="#">78</a> ) (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 2/27/2009) (Entered: 02/27/2009)
02/27/2009	<a href="#">80</a>	Declaration of Kevin F. Neyland in Support of <a href="#">78</a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Defendant Office of Management and Budget's Notice of Motion and Motion for Summary Judgment Ajudication</i> filed byOffice of Management and Budget. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit 1)(Related document(s) <a href="#">78</a> ) (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 2/27/2009) (Entered: 02/27/2009)

02/27/2009	<a href="#">81</a>	Proposed Order re <a href="#">78</a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Defendant Office of Management and Budget's Notice of Motion and Motion for Summary Judgment and Denying Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment</i> by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 2/27/2009) (Entered: 02/27/2009)
02/27/2009	<a href="#">82</a>	Second MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment</i> filed by Center for Biological Diversity. Motion Hearing set for 3/23/2009 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. (Pardee, Vera) (Filed on 2/27/2009) (Entered: 02/27/2009)
02/27/2009	<a href="#">83</a>	Declaration of Vera Pardee in Support of <a href="#">82</a> Second MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment</i> filed by Center for Biological Diversity. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A)(Related document(s) <a href="#">82</a> ) (Pardee, Vera) (Filed on 2/27/2009) (Entered: 02/27/2009)
02/27/2009	<a href="#">84</a>	Proposed Order re <a href="#">82</a> Second MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment</i> by Center for Biological Diversity. (Pardee, Vera) (Filed on 2/27/2009) (Entered: 02/27/2009)
03/13/2009	<a href="#">85</a>	MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment</i> filed by Office of Management and Budget. Motion Hearing set for 3/23/2009 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 3/13/2009) (Entered: 03/13/2009)
03/13/2009	<a href="#">86</a>	Declaration of Michael T. Pyle in Support of <a href="#">85</a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment</i> filed by Office of Management and Budget. (Related document(s) <a href="#">85</a> ) (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 3/13/2009) (Entered: 03/13/2009)
03/13/2009	<a href="#">87</a>	Declaration of Kevin F. Neyland in Support of <a href="#">85</a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment</i> filed by Office of Management and Budget. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit 1)(Related document(s) <a href="#">85</a> ) (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 3/13/2009) (Entered: 03/13/2009)
03/13/2009	<a href="#">88</a>	Declaration of Richard P. Theroux, Ph.D. in Support of <a href="#">85</a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment</i> filed by Office of Management and Budget. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit 1, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit 2, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit 3)(Related document(s) <a href="#">85</a> ) (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 3/13/2009) (Entered: 03/13/2009)
03/13/2009	<a href="#">89</a>	Proposed Order re <a href="#">85</a> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment</i> by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 3/13/2009) (Entered: 03/13/2009)

03/13/2009	<a href="#"><u>90</u></a>	MEMORANDUM in Opposition to OMB's Motion for Summary Judgment on ARMS Documents and Notice and Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Second Motion for Partial Judgment on Exchange Documents filed by Center for Biological Diversity. (Attachments: # <a href="#"><u>1</u></a> Proposed Order Granting Plaintiff's Second Motion for Partial Summary Judgment on Exchange Documents) (Pardee, Vera) (Filed on 3/13/2009) (Entered: 03/13/2009)
03/23/2009	<a href="#"><u>91</u></a>	Minute Entry: Motion Hearing held on 3/23/2009 before Hon. Marilyn Hall Patel (Date Filed: 3/23/2009) re Cross Motions for Summary Judgment; Further Status Conference set for 4/27/2009 03:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. (Court Reporter Margo Garule.) (awb, COURT-STAFF) (Date Filed: 3/23/2009) (Entered: 03/23/2009)
04/01/2009	<a href="#"><u>92</u></a>	STIPULATION and [Proposed] Order Continuing Hearing on Plaintiff's Motion to Permit an Action Which Exceeds the Total Amount of Government Claim by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 4/1/2009) (Entered: 04/01/2009)
04/20/2009	<a href="#"><u>93</u></a>	JOINT CASE MANAGEMENT STATEMENT filed by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 4/20/2009) (Entered: 04/20/2009)
04/24/2009	<a href="#"><u>94</u></a>	CLERKS NOTICE: Status Conference reset from 4/27/2009 to 6/15/2009 03:00 PM before the Hon. Marilyn Hall Patel (awb, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 4/24/2009) (Entered: 04/24/2009)
05/05/2009	<a href="#"><u>95</u></a>	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel: The court DENIES defendant's motion for summary judgment. The Vaughn Index and declarations are insufficient to allow the court to make a de novo review of how disclosure of a particular document would damage the interest provided by the claimed exemption. The court has ordered defendant to produce a more particularized Vaughn Index as to the privileges asserted, so that the court may have an adequate factual basis upon which it may make a de novo review of the defendant's withholding decisions. That Index should provide an accurate count of how many documents are contested and under which privileges, to address plaintiff's concerns about FOIA Exemption 6, inter alia, and to facilitate matters going forward. The court does not conclude that the documents are not exempt as a matter of law, only that the agency has failed to supply the court with the minimal information necessary to make such a determination. Therefore, plaintiff's motion for summary judgment is DENIED. However, OMB remains on notice that a failure to submit adequate revisions that provide the court with sufficiently particularized explanations of how disclosure will damage the interest protected by the claimed privilege will be deemed a waiver of that privilege. (awb, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 5/5/2009) (Entered: 05/05/2009)



05/05/2009	<a href="#"><u>96</u></a>	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER: Defendant's motion for summary judgement is GRANTED in part, with respect to documents asserted under FOIA Exemption 5, the attorney-client privilege, and FOIA Exemption 6, privacy. Defendant's motion for summary judgement is further GRANTED in part, with respect to documents which meet the courts rulings under FOIA Exemption 5, the deliberative process and presidential communications privileges. Defendant's motion for summary judgement is DENIED in part with respect to the remaining documents, which will be submitted in accordance with the parties future stipulation for in camera review.Plaintiff's motion for summary judgement is accordingly DENIED; Signed by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel on 5/5/2009. (awb, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 5/5/2009) (Entered: 05/05/2009)
06/03/2009	<a href="#"><u>97</u></a>	STIPULATION <i>and [Proposed]</i> Order to Continue Date for Further Case Management Conference by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 6/3/2009) (Entered: 06/03/2009)
06/04/2009	<a href="#"><u>98</u></a>	STIPULATION AND ORDER: Status Conference reset for 7/13/2009 03:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco; Signed by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel on 6/4/2009. (awb, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 6/4/2009) (Entered: 06/04/2009)
07/01/2009	<a href="#"><u>99</u></a>	JOINT CASE MANAGEMENT STATEMENT filed by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 7/1/2009) (Entered: 07/01/2009)
07/13/2009	<a href="#"><u>100</u></a>	Minute Entry: Status Conference held (Date Filed: 7/13/2009). Further Status Conference set for 10/5/2009 03:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. Case referred to Magistrate Judge for a Report and Recommendation for In Camera Review. (Court Reporter Katherine Sullivan.) (ls, COURT STAFF) (Date Filed: 7/13/2009) (Entered: 07/14/2009)
07/14/2009		CASE REFERRED to Magistrate Judge Magistrate Judge Bernard Zimmerman for Report and Recommendation "for in camera review." (wh, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/14/2009) (Entered: 07/14/2009)
07/31/2009	<a href="#"><u>101</u></a>	NOTICE by Office of Management and Budget of <i>In Camera Submissions to Judge Zimmerman</i> (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 7/31/2009) (Entered: 07/31/2009)
08/25/2009	<a href="#"><u>102</u></a>	REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS Objections to R&R due by 9/9/2009. Signed by Magistrate Judge Bernard Zimmerman on 8/24/2009. (bzsec, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 8/25/2009) (Entered: 08/25/2009)
09/09/2009	<a href="#"><u>103</u></a>	AMENDMENT TO REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION re <a href="#"><u>102</u></a> REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS. Signed by Magistrate Judge Bernard Zimmerman on 9/9/2009. (bzsec, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/9/2009) (Entered: 09/09/2009)

09/28/2009	<a href="#"><u>104</u></a>	JOINT CASE MANAGEMENT STATEMENT filed by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 9/28/2009) (Entered: 09/28/2009)
10/06/2009	<a href="#"><u>105</u></a>	Minute Entry: Status Conference (Date Filed: 10/6/2009). Defendant to identify documents by 10/6/09 and turnover documents by 4:00 p.m. on 10/13/09. Response is due by 10/15/09.Further Status Conference set for 10/19/2009 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. (Court Reporter Belle Ball.) (fj, COURT STAFF) (Date Filed: 10/6/2009) (Entered: 10/06/2009)
10/13/2009	<a href="#"><u>106</u></a>	STIPULATION <i>[Proposed] Stipulation Re Case Management Conference Date</i> by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 10/13/2009) (Entered: 10/13/2009)
10/14/2009	<a href="#"><u>107</u></a>	STIPULATION AND ORDER amending briefing schedules AND continuing Status Conference to 11/2/2009 03:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco; Signed by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel on 10/14/2009. (awb, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 10/14/2009) (Entered: 10/14/2009)
10/28/2009	<a href="#"><u>108</u></a>	STIPULATION <i>[Proposed] Stipulation Re Case Management Conference and Further Briefing Schedule</i> by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 10/28/2009) (Entered: 10/28/2009)
11/02/2009	<a href="#"><u>109</u></a>	ORDER by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel ADOPTING <a href="#"><u>102</u></a> Report and Recommendations. (awb, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 11/2/2009) (Entered: 11/02/2009)
11/03/2009	<a href="#"><u>110</u></a>	STIPULATION AND ORDER vacating 11/2/09 Case Management Conference; Signed by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel on 11/3/2009. (awb, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 11/3/2009) (Entered: 11/03/2009)
11/05/2009	<a href="#"><u>111</u></a>	STIPULATION <i>and [Proposed] Order Regarding Schedule for Resolution of Fee &amp; Cost Request</i> by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 11/5/2009) (Entered: 11/05/2009)
11/06/2009	<a href="#"><u>112</u></a>	STIPULATION AND ORDER setting briefing schedules: Motions re Costs/Fees to be filed by 1/15/2010; Oppositions to be filed by 1/29/2010; Replies to be filed by 2/16/2010; Motion Hearing reserved for 3/1/2010 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco; Signed by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel on 11/6/2009. (awb, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 11/6/2009) (Entered: 11/06/2009)
01/05/2010	<a href="#"><u>113</u></a>	STIPULATION <i>and [Proposed] Order Regarding Schedule for Resolution of Fee &amp; Cost Request</i> by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 1/5/2010) (Entered: 01/05/2010)



01/06/2010	<a href="#"><u>11</u></a> <a href="#"><u>4</u></a>	STIPULATION AND ORDER amending briefing schedules: Motions to be filed by 1/25/2010; Oppositions to be filed by 2/5/2010; Signed by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel on 1/6/2010. (awb, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 1/6/2010) (Entered: 01/06/2010)
01/20/2010	<a href="#"><u>11</u></a> <a href="#"><u>5</u></a>	NOTICE by Office of Management and Budget of <i>Unavailability</i> (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 1/20/2010) (Entered: 01/20/2010)
01/25/2010	<a href="#"><u>11</u></a> <a href="#"><u>6</u></a>	MOTION for Attorney Fees filed by Center for Biological Diversity. Motion Hearing set for 3/1/2010 02:00 PM in Courtroom 15, 18th Floor, San Francisco. (Sivas, Deborah) (Filed on 1/25/2010) (Entered: 01/25/2010)
01/25/2010	<a href="#"><u>11</u></a> <a href="#"><u>7</u></a>	Declaration of Vera Pardee in Support of <a href="#"><u>116</u></a> MOTION for Attorney Fees filed byCenter for Biological Diversity. (Related document(s) <a href="#"><u>116</u></a> ) (Sivas, Deborah) (Filed on 1/25/2010) (Entered: 01/25/2010)
01/25/2010	<a href="#"><u>11</u></a> <a href="#"><u>8</u></a>	Declaration of Deborah Sivas in Support of <a href="#"><u>116</u></a> MOTION for Attorney Fees filed byCenter for Biological Diversity. (Related document(s) <a href="#"><u>116</u></a> ) (Sivas, Deborah) (Filed on 1/25/2010) (Entered: 01/25/2010)
01/25/2010	<a href="#"><u>11</u></a> <a href="#"><u>9</u></a>	Declaration of Justin Augustine in Support of <a href="#"><u>116</u></a> MOTION for Attorney Fees filed byCenter for Biological Diversity. (Related document(s) <a href="#"><u>116</u></a> ) (Sivas, Deborah) (Filed on 1/25/2010) (Entered: 01/25/2010)
01/25/2010	<a href="#"><u>12</u></a> <a href="#"><u>0</u></a>	Declaration of Richard Toshiyuki Drury in Support of <a href="#"><u>116</u></a> MOTION for Attorney Fees filed byCenter for Biological Diversity. (Related document(s) <a href="#"><u>116</u></a> ) (Sivas, Deborah) (Filed on 1/25/2010) (Entered: 01/25/2010)
01/25/2010	<a href="#"><u>12</u></a> <a href="#"><u>1</u></a>	Declaration of James Wheaton in Support of <a href="#"><u>116</u></a> MOTION for Attorney Fees filed byCenter for Biological Diversity. (Related document(s) <a href="#"><u>116</u></a> ) (Sivas, Deborah) (Filed on 1/25/2010) (Entered: 01/25/2010)
01/25/2010	<a href="#"><u>12</u></a> <a href="#"><u>2</u></a>	Proposed Order re <a href="#"><u>116</u></a> MOTION for Attorney Fees by Center for Biological Diversity. (Sivas, Deborah) (Filed on 1/25/2010) (Entered: 01/25/2010)
02/04/2010	<a href="#"><u>12</u></a> <a href="#"><u>3</u></a>	STIPULATION and <i>[Proposed]</i> Order Approving Settlement and Dismissal of <i>Plaintiff's Claims</i> by Office of Management and Budget. (Pyle, Michael) (Filed on 2/4/2010) (Entered: 02/04/2010)
02/09/2010	<a href="#"><u>12</u></a> <a href="#"><u>4</u></a>	STIPULATION AND ORDER APPROVING SETTLEMENT AND DISMISSING CASE; Signed by Judge Marilyn Hall Patel on 2/8/2010. (awb, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 2/9/2010) (Entered: 02/09/2010)

## PACER Service Center

### Transaction Receipt

09/22/2011 14:26:28

<b>PACER Login:</b>	pb0232	<b>Client Code:</b>	foiaproj
<b>Description:</b>	Docket Report	<b>Search Criteria:</b>	3:07-cv-04997-MHP
<b>Billable Pages:</b>	10	<b>Cost:</b>	0.80